Empowerment in agricultural value chains: Mixed methods evidence from the Philippines

Hazel Malapit\(^1\), Catherine Ragasa\(^1\), Elena Martinez\(^1\), Deborah Rubin\(^2\), Agnes Quisumbing\(^1\), Greg Seymour\(^1\)

\(^1\)International Food Policy Research Institute
\(^2\)Cultural Practice
Motivation

- Large body of literature on tools and methods to analyze economic dimensions in VC analysis
  - Getahun and Villanger 2018; Van den Broeck, Van Hoyweghen, and Maertens 2018; Said-Allsopp and Tallontire 2015; Senders et al. 2014; Riisgaard et al. 2008, 2010; Rubin, Manfre, and Nichols Barrett 2009; Mayoux and Mackie 2009
- Only recently have equity and distributional impacts been included in the VC analysis
- The early work on gender in VC s uncovered important insights into the unintended consequences of VC participation
  - Recent studies on the horticulture boom find positive impacts on rural employment, especially women’s employment, which contributes to poverty reduction and improved child outcomes
    - Maertens and Swinnen 2009, 2012; Maertens, Colen, and Swinnen 2011; Maertens and Verhofstadt 2013
  - Gendered responsibilities and time burdens changed with greater commercialization and adversely impact domestic care, food production, or food security
    - Lyon, Mutersbaugh, and Worthen 2017; Forsythe, Martin, and Posthumus 2015; Filipski et al. 2017; Arndt, Benfica, and Thurlow 2011; Shackleton et al. 2011
  - As commercialization intensifies and a commodity gains higher value, women start losing control over production/marketing & men start taking charge
    - Ashby et al. 2009; Forsythe, Posthumus, and Martin 2016
- Gendered VC research tends to be more qualitative, with limited quantitative, dearth of mixed method approach, focus exclusively on women and producers and laborers, with rare mention or analysis of men or of intermediary actors of the VC
- We fill these gaps by using a mixed methods approach, combining index-based measure of empowerment and qualitative approach, comparing both women and men along stages of the VC—production, processing, and marketing—in the context of the Philippines
Research Questions

- How empowered are women and men participants in focus agricultural value chains?
- What are the sources of disempowerment of women and men in these VCs?
- What gender-based constraints do women and men face within each VC?
- Are some VCs and higher nodes of the VCs more empowering than others?
Data Sources and Methods

- WEAI4VC - Expands empowerment measure to cover multiple stages, different types of actors in VC
  - Pro-WEAI quantitative & qualitative protocols as starting point
  - Expands production module to livelihoods, including entrepreneurship and wage work
  - Naila Kabeer (1999): expanding people’s ability to make strategic life choices, particularly in contexts in which this ability had been denied to them; Resources, Agency, and Achievements

Philippines WEAI4VC Pilot
- Supported by the Millennium Challenge Corporation
- Assess empowerment and intrahousehold equality of participants in 4 priority value chains (abaca, coconut, seaweed, swine)
- Survey with 1600 households in 4 provinces (Sorsogon, Cebu, Bohol, Leyte); 40 KIs (coconut, seaweed)
- 400 HH per VC; 1250 DHH (1200 M, 1200 W) and 350 WOH
Abaca (Manila hemp)
Philippines is the leading producer of abaca fiber, supplying 87 percent of global output

Coconut
Major export; ¼ of agricultural land devoted to coconut farming
Seaweed
Philippines is third largest producer globally, mainly producing *Eucheuma* → extract carrageenan

Swine
2nd largest ag revenue earner; pork is main meat consumed; 65% of swine were raised in backyard farms
Domains and indicators of the project-level Women’s Empowerment in Agriculture Index (pro-WEAI)
Result 1: Relatively higher empowerment scores for both women and men and intrahousehold equality compared to other countries; but still, most women and men in all 4 VCs are not empowered.
Result 2: Main source of disempowerment is weak intrinsic agency; other main sources are control over use of income, workload and collective agency, with varying degree depending on VC and gender.
Result 2a: There are differences across VC and nodes along the VCs (abaca)
Result 2b: There are differences across VC and nodes along the VCs (coconut)
Result 3: Strong gender stereotypes persist, constraining participation and gains from VCs

- Strong attitudes of maintaining sex-aggregation in the workforce
  - Both men and women spoke about the different types of work they do (and should do)
- Some sub-indicators favor men, some favor women
  - Coconut: Low involvement of women in coconut production (climbing trees), mainly involved in low-value crafts and processing; low involvement of men in groups
  - Seaweed: Piecework for women seaweed producers offers more flexibility to combine with domestic responsibilities, but still paid less than men
  - Only 25% of women say they have childcare—so a vast majority still needs to juggle domestic and productive work
  - Autonomy in income was a large contributor to disempowerment in all 4 VCs, and larger for men than women
  - Workload is more disempowering for women than men
Result 4a. Women and men in seaweed households were more empowered than those in other VCs

- The seaweed VC provided increased employment and livelihood opportunities, consistent with Arnold (2008)
  - Seaweed requires less capital investment and provides higher returns than other export commodities and other aquaculture species, so it is potentially a pro-poor, empowering, export-oriented VC
  - Entrenched social inequities are slowly shifting and previously marginalized people can take advantage of opportunities to improve their standard of living, mobility, and influence due to increased income from seaweed farming

- Other VCs have been less empowering
  - Autonomy in income was a large contributor to disempowerment, especially in other 3 VCs
  - Lack of autonomy in income can reflect dissatisfaction towards the VC or aspirations for other livelihoods, reflecting the limits of agricultural VCs in improving welfare
  - Most households augment income and cope with risk by diversifying their livelihoods beyond these VCs, suggesting that nonagricultural jobs may be more lucrative or stable
Result 4b. Women and men in higher nodes of VC are not always the most empowered

- Women coconut traders, men abaca processors, and men and women swine traders were more empowered than producers in those VCs.
- While coconut and swine processors and seaweed and abaca traders were less empowered than producers in those VCs.
- Workload is most disempowering among women processors and traders in abaca, coconut and seaweed VCs, suggesting that moving up along the nodes of the VC may pose greater work load for women, disproportionate to the additional market and income access they derive.
- Most women did not aspire to move up the VC; for the few who did, lack of capital restricted this goal, implying much needed support for both capital, facilitation and skills development support for women agrientrepreneurship, beyond micro-credit.
Some reflections

- Despite a relatively egalitarian culture in the Philippines, gender norms persist across all four VCs that lead to disempowerment for both women and men → will require transformative approaches that cut across VCs and locations.

- Stratifying by VC, we found that both overall empowerment and some of the most important areas of disempowerment vary between households engaged in different VCs, even in the same geographical area.
  - Work balance, control over use of income, and group membership were the second most important contributors to disempowerment but varied by VC, suggesting that interventions intended to empower women should be tailored by VC.

- Paper shows how researchers and practitioners can measure, compare and identify sources of disempowerment of women and men in specific VCs and find ways to address them that are targeted specifically to each VC.

- The indicators used in this study can be used in impact evaluations of VC interventions and can be part of a rigorous impact assessment design.

- WEAI4VC adjustments ongoing → AUDA/NEPAD-led women-targeted agricultural vocational training in Malawi and Benin.
We would like to acknowledge all CGIAR Research Programs and Centers for supporting the participation of their gender scientists to the Seeds of Change conference.

Photo: Neil Palmer/IWMI